



The biology and status of the Arctic grayling in Sunnyslope Canal, Montana
by Scott Alan Barndt

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science in
Biological Sciences
Montana State University
© Copyright by Scott Alan Barndt (1996)

Abstract:

The Arctic grayling (*Thymallus arcticus*) in Sunnyslope Canal were studied to examine factors limiting this population. Population characteristics, fish movements, winter habitat conditions, survival beneath ice cover, spawning, movements and habitat use of age-0 fry, and the presence of other species were examined. Results of this study confirm that Arctic grayling in the upper, 9 km of the Sunnyslope Canal represent a self-sustaining population that reproduces successfully in this unusual habitat, and that survives in remnant pools sustained by water leaking through the gates at Pishkun Reservoir and from springs along the canal during an extended, seven-month period when water does not flow through the canal. Reproduction within the canal was confirmed by a combination of observations: young fry were captured in drift nets 5.8 km downstream from the dam, but not at the outlet at Pishkun Reservoir; age-0 young were both visually observed and captured by seining within the canal; and spawning behavior was seen and developing embryos subsequently collected at a site within the canal. Fish seined in remnant pools, before pools froze over in autumn and then after ice-cover thawed in spring, indicated that overwinter survival was high (at least 75.4% through the winter of 1994-95, 89.5% in 1995-96). Dissolved oxygen concentrations remained high beneath ice cover, from 3.4 to 13.1 mg/l. Locations of recaptured fish and telemetry of radio-tagged fish indicated that they remained in the same pools through the winter. Recaptures of fish marked during the summer flow period and telemetry of radio-tagged fish indicated that fish moved upstream in the canal as water flows were reduced and then stopped at the end of the irrigation season. Concentrations of age-0 young within the upper part of the canal, including within the outlet tunnel beneath the dam, strongly suggested that they also move upstream as flows diminish. Telemetry of larger fish and downstream captures of age-0 and older fish suggested that many fish move down during summer flows and appear to be the source of grayling found in irrigation ditches diverted from the canal and in pools remaining at the lower drop structures after flows cease. During the summer flow period, canal grayling appeared to thrive, with good condition factors and among the fastest growth rates of any population in Montana. Success of grayling in the canal appears related to a combination of their ability to spawn under the flow and substrate conditions present, the ability of age-0 young to maintain position and survive within the upper canal, the tendency of both age-0 and older fish to move upstream as flows are reduced at the end of the irrigation season, their ability to overwinter in a few, remnant pools in the upper canal, the apparent habitat suitability of the canal for grayling during the summer flow period, and the apparent unsuitability of the canal for the principal, non-native potential competitors and predators present—rainbow trout (*Onchorhynchus mykiss*) and northern pike (*Esox lucius*). Numbers of fish (not including early age-0 grayling) remained low throughout the two-year study period, with about 62 to 120 estimated present from spring of 1995 to spring 1996. The loss of thousands of age-0 fish into the reservoir in fall 1994 during repair work at the dam, and continuing, apparently natural, downstream loss of fish have contributed to continuing low numbers, but other factors limiting the population are not known.

THE BIOLOGY AND STATUS OF THE ARCTIC GRAYLING IN
SUNNYSLOPE CANAL, MONTANA

by

Scott Alan Barndt

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree

of

Master of Science

in

Biological Sciences

MONTANA STATE UNIVERSITY
Bozeman, Montana

December 1996

N378
B2598

APPROVAL

of a thesis submitted by

Scott Alan Barndt

This thesis has been read by each member of the thesis committee and has been found to be satisfactory regarding content, English usage, format, citations, bibliographic style, and consistency, and is ready for submission to the College of Graduate Studies.

12/6/96
Date

Cal Stange
Chairperson, Graduate Committee

Approved for the Major Department

12/6/96
Date

E. R. Nyse
Head, Major Department

Approved for the College of Graduate Studies

1/20/97
Date

R. A. Brown
Graduate Dean

STATEMENT OF PERMISSION TO USE

In presenting this thesis in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a master's degree at Montana State University-Bozeman, I agree that the Library shall make it available to borrowers under rules of the Library.

If I have indicated my intention to copyright this thesis by including a copyright notice page, copying is allowable only for scholarly purposes, consistent with "fair use" as prescribed in the U.S. Copyright Law. Requests for permission for extended quotation from or reproduction of this thesis in whole or in part may be granted only by the copyright holder.

Signature



Date

11 December 1996

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author wishes to thank the following people, who among others, assisted him through the course of this study. Dr. Calvin M. Kaya provided overall supervision and counsel for the project, and assisted in the preparation of the manuscript. Drs. Thomas McMahon, Alexander V. Zale, and Lynn Irby reviewed the manuscript. Michael Gangloff, Peter Anselmo, Kelly Smith, and many others gave me valuable field assistance. Bill Hill provided equipment, field assistance, information, and valuable expertise. Dr. Dan Gustafson produced excellent maps and invertebrate expertise. Greenfields Irrigation District provided free access to the canal system and to their files. Special thanks to Laurence Vincent for his hospitality, help, and astute observations. Finally, special thanks to my many friends, my family, and, especially, my wife Rosie, for their support throughout my academic career. This study was made possible by grants to Calvin M. Kaya, project principal investigator, from Montana Department of Fish, Wildlife, and Parks and from the Montana Fluvial Arctic Grayling Recovery Program (Buddy Drake, treasurer).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
VITA	iv
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	v
LIST OF TABLES	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	x
ABSTRACT	xiii
INTRODUCTION	1
STUDY SITE DESCRIPTION	5
METHODS	10
Canal Flow and Water Quality	10
Capture and Analysis Techniques	10
Age and Growth	11
Condition Factors and Sex Ratios	11
Population Estimates	12
Movements	12
Radio-telemetry	14
Sexual Maturation and Spawning	15
Distribution, and Habitat of Early, Age-0 Young	16
Habitat Use by Juveniles and Adults	18
Other Species of Fish in the Canal	19
RESULTS	20
Canal Flow and Water Quality	20
Age and Growth	22
Length-frequency Distributions	26
Condition Factors and Sex Ratios	30
Population Estimates	32
Movements	33
Mortality and Transmitter Performance of	
Radio-tagged Grayling	33
Radio-telemetry, 1994	34
Radio-telemetry, 1995-96	36
Movements of Recaptured, Marked Fish	40
Sexual Maturation and Spawning	43
Distribution and Habitat of Early, Age-0 Young	47
Habitat Use by Juveniles and Adults	52
Spring and Summer Flow Period	52

TABLE OF CONTENTS-Continued

	Page
Non-flow Period, Including Winter	56
Other Species of Fish in the Canal	58
DISCUSSION	61
Physical and Chemical Habitat	61
Population Characteristics	64
Growth Rates and Condition Factors	65
Mortality of Radio-tagged Grayling	69
Movements	69
Sexual Maturation and Spawning	73
Distribution and Habitat of Early, Age-0 Young	77
Other Species of Fish in the Canal	80
SUMMARY	82
MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS	86
REFERENCES	88
APPENDICES	94
Appendix A - Table and Figure Related to Results	95
Appendix B - Telemetry of Individual Grayling in Sunnyslope Canal	100
Appendix C - Incidental Observations of Grayling in Tunnel Lake	125
Appendix D - Observations of Sunnyslope Canal Spawning Behavior	132
Appendix E - Observation of Other Species in Sunnyslope Canal	135

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1. Major physical features on Sunnyslope Canal and their distance downstream from Pishkun Reservoir	6
2. Mean, (standard deviation), and range of physical and chemical habitat measurements for upper Sunnyslope Canal during the ice-free period, April 13-November 16, 1995. Conductivity is reported at 25 °C	22
3. Numbers and mean total lengths (MTL) in millimeters for each age class, by sex and age, of mature Arctic grayling captured in Sunnyslope Canal, spring sampling periods, 1994-96	23
4. Average calculated lengths at succeeding annuli and annual increments of growth for Arctic grayling captured in Sunnyslope Canal in the springs of 1994-96.	24
5. Comparison of summer and winter growth (mm) for 11 recaptured, VI-tagged Sunnyslope Canal Arctic grayling, 1994-96. W94= winter of 1994-95; S95= summer of 1995; W95= winter of 1995-96	25
6. Numbers, sex ratios, and means and ranges of total length (mm), weight (g), and condition factor (K) for male and female adult (age 2 or older) and for juvenile (age 0 and age 1) Arctic grayling captured in Sunnyslope Canal, 1994-96	31
7. Population estimates for Sunnyslope Canal, 1995-1996	32
8. Movements of 19 Sunnyslope Canal grayling captured by angling in the summer of 1995, and by seining in autumn 1995. U= movement upstream; D= movement downstream; between capture dates. Canal was turned off September 22, 1995	41
9. Physical parameters of the spawning riffle used by Arctic grayling in Sunnyslope Canal in spring 1995. Measurements were taken at two meter increments along the total length of riffle used (18 m)	46
10. Percentages of substrate sizes (mm) estimated in 0.5 m ² plots taken every two meters in an Arctic grayling spawning riffle in Sunnyslope Canal, 1995	46
11. Age-0 grayling and northern pike captured by drift nets at the reservoir outlet and at Boadle Bridge (5.8 km downstream) in Sunnyslope Canal, 1994 and 1995. Sampling began when newly swimming grayling fry appeared on June 8 both years, and continued until fry disappeared from canal margins. Two nets were set at each location each year	49

LIST OF TABLES-Continued

Table	Page
12. Grayling fry observed in seventeen 100-m transects from Pishkun Reservoir to Fairfield, on June 15 and June 22, 1995. Observations were made June 27 and July 5 but no fry were seen	50
13. Habitat use parameters of Sunnyslope Canal grayling fry in summer 1995 where TD is total depth (cm), FD is focal depth (cm), FV is focal velocity (m/s), and DC is distance from cover (cm)	51
14. Mean lengths (mm) of age-0 grayling in Sunnyslope Canal during the summers of 1994 and 1995	52
15. Characteristics of the 13 pools in upper Sunnyslope Canal under ice cover, March 4, 1996. Major overwintering pools are denoted with an *. The final five pools winter-killed in 1996	57
16. Mean and (range) of physical and chemical habitat measurements during ice-cover in the winters of 1994-95 (1994) and 1995-96 (1995) in Sunnyslope Canal: Temperature (°C), specific conductance (umhos at 25 °C), dissolved oxygen (mg/l), and ice thickness and water depth beneath ice (cm) . . .	58
17. Calculated total lengths (mm) at succeeding annuli of six Montana Arctic grayling studies from Montana. Studies are arranged in descending order based on length at age-V	66

Appendix A

1. Lengths at annulus (in mm) for 30 recaptured Sunnyslope Canal Arctic grayling, from spring 1994 to spring 1996	96
---	----

Appendix C

1. Grayling transferred to Tunnel Lake from Sunnyslope Canal, 1985 to 1993	126
2. Physical characteristics of six observed Arctic grayling spawning locations in the inlet of Tunnel Lake	128
3. Percentages of substrate sizes (mm) at six observed spawning sites in the inlet to Tunnel Lake	129
4. Habitat use parameters of grayling fry in Tunnel Lake, Montana, in summer, 1995	130

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
1. Dendrogram produced by cluster analysis of Nei's genetic distance based on information from 39 protein loci analyzed in Montana and Wyoming Arctic grayling populations (reproduced from Leary 1990)	4
2. Watershed map of Greenfields Irrigation Project, from the Pishkun Supply Canal to discharge into the Sun River and Muddy Creek	7
3. Watershed map of the Sunnyslope Canal study area from Pishkun Reservoir to Fairfield, MT, showing five drop structures (Old SRS, UTB, LTB, Nine, and "A") and 17 fry survey transects (gray stippled lines bisecting canal). The C denotes the beginning of concrete lining which is the first obstacle to upstream movement of grayling. The P shows the downstream extent of post-flow habitat	8
4. Discharge profiles for Sunnyslope Canal, 1994-95. Double bar indicates approximate spawning times while the single bar denotes fry swimup	21
5. Length-frequency distribution of Arctic grayling in upper Sunnyslope Canal, in spring 1994	27
6. Length-frequency distribution of Arctic grayling in upper Sunnyslope Canal, in spring 1995	28
7. Length-frequency distribution of Arctic grayling in upper Sunnyslope Canal, in spring 1996	29
8. Movements of radio-tagged grayling CD6 (radio frequency 49.054 mhz) during the spring and summer of 1994, from tagging until transmitter expiration	35
9. Movements of three radio-tagged male Arctic grayling during spring and summer, 1995, in Sunnyslope Canal	37
10. Movements of male Arctic grayling CA3 (49.613 mhz) during 1995 and 1996, in Sunnyslope Canal	39
11. Overwintering areas (in black, and named) in upper Sunnyslope Canal and locations of three velocity transects (V) during summer flow. Major overwintering locations are denoted with an *, and double lines indicate the downstream extent of winter habitat in 1995-96	54
12. Velocity profiles (m/s) of three areas used by Sunnyslope Canal Arctic grayling during flow conditions	55

LIST OF FIGURES-Continued

Figure	Page
13. Growth curves of six Arctic grayling populations in Montana . .	67

Appendix A

1. Larval fish captured in Sunnyslope Canal in 1994 and 1995 (Kaya 1994, unpublished)	97
---	----

Appendix B

1. Movements of grayling CJ6 (49.302) during spring 1994 in Sunnyslope Canal from tagging until tag expiration	102
2. Movements of grayling CB6 (49.352) during spring and summer 1994 in Sunnyslope Canal from tagging until tag expiration	103
3. Movements of grayling CJ9 (49.228) during spring and summer of 1994 in Sunnyslope Canal from tagging until tag expiration	105
4. Movements of grayling CB2 (49.128) during spring and summer of 1994 in Sunnyslope Canal from tagging until tag expiration	106
5. Movements of grayling F12 (49.203) during spring and summer of 1994 in Sunnyslope Canal from tagging until tag expiration	108
6. Movements of grayling F08 (49.177) during spring of 1994 in Sunnyslope Canal from tagging until loss of contact	109
7. Movements of grayling CJ0 (49.227) during spring and summer of 1994 in Sunnyslope Canal from tagging until tag expiration	110
8. Movements of grayling CJ1 (49.327) during spring and summer of 1994 in Sunnyslope Canal from tagging until tag expiration	111
9. Movements of grayling CH5 (49.003) during spring and summer of 1994 in Sunnyslope Canal from tagging until tag expiration	112
10. Movements of grayling CH6 (49.103) during spring and summer of 1994 in Sunnyslope Canal from tagging until tag expiration	113

LIST OF FIGURES-Continued

Figure	Page
11. Movements of grayling CJ4 (49.494) in Sunnyslope Canal during spring 1995 from tagging until death	115
12. Movements of grayling F58 (49.553) in Sunnyslope Canal in spring 1995 from tagging until assumed death	116
13. Movements of grayling F43 (49.512) in Sunnyslope Canal during spring 1995 from tagging until tag loss	117
14. Movements of grayling F42 (49.494) in Sunnyslope Canal in spring 1995 from tagging until assumed death	119
15. Movements of grayling F57 (49.594) in Sunnyslope Canal in spring 1995 from tagging until death	120
16. Movements of grayling F30 (49.628) in Sunnyslope Canal during winter 1995-96 and in spring 1996 from tagging until loss of contact	123

ABSTRACT

The Arctic grayling (*Thymallus arcticus*) in Sunnyslope Canal were studied to examine factors limiting this population. Population characteristics, fish movements, winter habitat conditions, survival beneath ice cover, spawning, movements and habitat use of age-0 fry, and the presence of other species were examined. Results of this study confirm that Arctic grayling in the upper, 9 km of the Sunnyslope Canal represent a self-sustaining population that reproduces successfully in this unusual habitat, and that survives in remnant pools sustained by water leaking through the gates at Pishkun Reservoir and from springs along the canal during an extended, seven-month period when water does not flow through the canal. Reproduction within the canal was confirmed by a combination of observations: young fry were captured in drift nets 5.8 km downstream from the dam, but not at the outlet at Pishkun Reservoir; age-0 young were both visually observed and captured by seining within the canal; and spawning behavior was seen and developing embryos subsequently collected at a site within the canal. Fish seined in remnant pools, before pools froze over in autumn and then after ice-cover thawed in spring, indicated that overwinter survival was high (at least 75.4% through the winter of 1994-95, 89.5% in 1995-96). Dissolved oxygen concentrations remained high beneath ice cover, from 3.4 to 13.1 mg/l. Locations of recaptured fish and telemetry of radio-tagged fish indicated that they remained in the same pools through the winter. Recaptures of fish marked during the summer flow period and telemetry of radio-tagged fish indicated that fish moved upstream in the canal as water flows were reduced and then stopped at the end of the irrigation season. Concentrations of age-0 young within the upper part of the canal, including within the outlet tunnel beneath the dam, strongly suggested that they also move upstream as flows diminish. Telemetry of larger fish and downstream captures of age-0 and older fish suggested that many fish move down during summer flows and appear to be the source of grayling found in irrigation ditches diverted from the canal and in pools remaining at the lower drop structures after flows cease. During the summer flow period, canal grayling appeared to thrive, with good condition factors and among the fastest growth rates of any population in Montana. Success of grayling in the canal appears related to a combination of their ability to spawn under the flow and substrate conditions present, the ability of age-0 young to maintain position and survive within the upper canal, the tendency of both age-0 and older fish to move upstream as flows are reduced at the end of the irrigation season, their ability to overwinter in a few, remnant pools in the upper canal, the apparent habitat suitability of the canal for grayling during the summer flow period, and the apparent unsuitability of the canal for the principal, non-native potential competitors and predators present—rainbow trout (*Onchorhynchus mykiss*) and northern pike (*Esox lucius*). Numbers of fish (not including early age-0 grayling) remained low throughout the two-year study period, with about 62 to 120 estimated present from spring of 1995 to spring 1996. The loss of thousands of age-0 fish into the reservoir in fall 1994 during repair work at the dam, and continuing, apparently natural, downstream loss of fish have contributed to continuing low numbers, but other factors limiting the population are not known.

INTRODUCTION

Historically, relict populations of Arctic grayling (Thymallus arcticus) (hereafter interchangeably referred to as "Arctic grayling" or "grayling") occurred in two regions within the lower 48 states of North America, within the present states of Michigan and Montana. These populations were geographically isolated as the southernmost populations of Arctic grayling by the Wisconsin glaciation, and both have undergone severe declines within the last century. The Michigan population became extinct by 1936, and the Montana populations have declined until the species persists in its native habitat only in the Big Hole River and Red Rock Lakes (Vincent 1962, Kaya 1992). Both of these populations are reduced from their former numbers. The Big Hole population retains the important distinction of being the only fluvial (entirely riverine) population remaining in the lower 48 states. This is a change from historic grayling distribution in Montana, as fluvial grayling were once widespread and locally common in the upper Missouri River drainage above the Great Falls whereas the Red Rock Lakes (and possibly nearby Elk Lake) contained the only adfluvial (stream spawning, lake dwelling) population in the state. In contrast to fluvial populations, lacustrine populations have become more common by stocking mountain lakes, both in Montana and other states (Kaya 1990).

The decline of the Arctic grayling in its native habitat is attributed to three factors: (1) degradation of habitat, especially by dewatering for irrigation; (2) interactions with non-native salmonids; and (3) overharvest (Vincent 1962, Kaya 1992). Recent studies have focused on determining important factors limiting native fluvial grayling (i.e., Magee

and Byorth 1994, Jeanes 1996). Such studies could have important applications to current recovery and reintroduction efforts.

A population of Arctic grayling located in an unusual habitat, the Sun River Slope Canal (Sunnyslope Canal), offered a unique opportunity to study factors which can affect the species. In 1971, Montana Department of Fish, Wildlife and Parks (FWP) biologist Bill Hill determined that Arctic grayling were present in the Sunnyslope Canal. This canal begins at the dam forming Pishkun Reservoir, and these fish occupy a fluvial habitat, at least during the four to five month irrigation season. During this period, the canal carries up to 47.5 cubic meters per second (m^3/s) or about 1680 cubic feet per second (cfs). During the remaining seven months, the canal is completely dewatered, with the exception of intermittent pools extending for about 5.8 km from the dam, and isolated pools at the base of concrete "drop structures" further downstream.

Arctic grayling were stocked in Pishkun Reservoir at least seven times in 1937, 1939, 1942 and 1943 (Everett 1986, Hill 1988, Kaya 1990). Records do not clearly indicate the source of these grayling but they likely originated from Madison River/Ennis Reservoir stocks (Everett 1986, Kaya 1990). Grayling subsequently became established in Sunnyslope Canal apparently from passage through the outlet of fish from these stockings, or their progeny. Some people report the presence of grayling in the canal since the 1940's (L. Vincent, Greenfields Irrigation District (GID), pers. comm.), and they have certainly been present since 1971, when Hill observed their presence. Arctic grayling apparently no longer exist in the reservoir, as the last reported catches of grayling were in 1971 and 1981 (Hill pers. comm.). Grayling in the canal have attracted some angler interest. In the past, anglers reportedly lined up below the reservoir

outlet "shoulder-to-shoulder" to catch grayling (T. Tabor pers. comm.) and would "fill buckets" with their catch (L. Vincent pers. comm.).

The Sunnyslope Canal Arctic grayling are genetically distinct from all other Montana grayling populations (Everett 1986, Leary 1990). Despite their likely derivation from Madison River/Ennis Reservoir stock, as well their relatively short existence in the canal, Everett found that the Sunnyslope Canal population shows significant separation from both Red Rock Lake stocks and stocks descendent from the Madison River/Ennis Reservoir population (Everett 1986). Further, Sunnyslope grayling show similar separation from the Big Hole River population (Figure 1).

This present study was initiated in 1994 to determine the conditions under which this population persists within the unusual environment of this seasonally intermittent canal. The purpose of the study was to determine whether there is a self-sustaining population of Arctic grayling in Sunnyslope Canal, adapted to inhabiting the canal and reproducing during summer flow and surviving non-flow conditions, including during winter. This hypothesis was tested by examining:

- (1) population abundance, age-size distribution, and individual growth rates;
- (2) fish movements, during flow and after;
- (3) winter habitat conditions and survival of grayling beneath ice cover;
- (4) spawning times, substrates, and locations; and
- (5) distribution, movement, and habitat use of age-0 fry and juveniles.
- (6) presence of potential competing species.

