Arsenate-Induced Changes in Bacterial Metabolite and Lipid Pools during Phosphate Stress

Weiping Zhuang,a,b Narayanaganesh Balasubramanian,b Lu Wang,c Qian Wang,c Timothy R. McDermott,c Valérie Copié,b Gejiao Wang,a Brian Bothnerb

aState Key Laboratory of Agricultural Microbiology, College of Life Science and Technology, Huazhong Agricultural University, Wuhan, China
bDepartment of Chemistry and Biochemistry, Montana State University, Bozeman, Montana, USA
cDepartment of Land Resources and Environmental Sciences, Montana State University, Bozeman, Montana, USA

ABSTRACT Agrobacterium tumefaciens GW4 is a heterotrophic arsenite-oxidizing bacterium with a high resistance to arsenic toxicity. It is now a model organism for studying the processes of arsenic detoxification and utilization. Previously, we demonstrated that under low-phosphate conditions, arsenate [As(V)] could enhance bacterial growth and be incorporated into biomolecules, including lipids. While the basic microbial As(V) resistance mechanisms have been characterized, global metabolic responses under low phosphate remain largely unknown. In the present work, the impacts of As(V) and low phosphate on intracellular metabolite and lipid profiles of GW4 were quantified using liquid chromatography-mass spectroscopy (LC-MS) in combination with transcriptional assays and the analysis of intracellular ATP and NADH levels. Metabolite profiling revealed that oxidative stress response pathways were altered and suggested an increase in DNA repair. Changes in metabolite levels in the tricarboxylic acid (TCA) cycle along with increased ATP are consistent with As(V)-enhanced growth of A. tumefaciens GW4. Lipidomics analysis revealed that most glycerophospholipids decreased in abundance when As(V) was available. However, several glycerolipid classes increased, an outcome that is consistent with maximizing growth via a phosphate-sparing phenotype. Differentially regulated lipids included phosphatidylcholine and lysophospholipids, which have not been previously reported in A. tumefaciens. The metabolites and lipids identified in this study deepen our understanding of the interplay between phosphate and arsenate on chemical and metabolic levels.

IMPORTANCE Arsenic is widespread in the environment and is one of the most ubiquitous environmental pollutants. Paradoxically, the growth of certain bacteria is enhanced by arsenic when phosphate is limited. Arsenate and phosphate are chemically similar, and this behavior is believed to represent a phosphate-sparing phenotype in which arsenate is used in place of phosphate in certain biomolecules. The research presented here uses a global approach to track metabolic changes in an environmentally relevant bacterium during exposure to arsenate when phosphate is low. Our findings are relevant for understanding the environmental fate of arsenic as well as how human-associated microbiomes respond to this common toxin.

KEYWORDS Agrobacterium tumefaciens GW4, arsenate, LC-MS/MS, lipidomic, metabolomic

Arsenic is widely present in the earth’s crust, occurring naturally in soil, water, and air. In addition to natural geological processes, anthropogenic activities contribute to arsenic found in the environment (1). Arsenic is a known carcinogen and is responsible for several human diseases, including cardiovascular and neurological disorders and diabetes (2). As such, it is ranked first on the U.S. Priority List of Hazardous
Substances (Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry [https://www.atsdr.cdc.gov]). Inorganic arsenite [As(III)] and arsenate [As(V)] are the most prevalent chemical species found in the environment. As(III) is more toxic and more mobile than As(V), making it more problematic for natural resource management, mitigation to exposure, and biological assimilation. Microbial transformations are major drivers of this speciation (3) and are important to better understand the mechanisms of arsenic assimilation and toxicity in the environment. Microbe-arsenic interactions have been widely investigated, and the resulting processes are generally classified as mechanisms of arsenic resistance/detoxification or arsenic oxidation as a means of generating cellular energy. Primary arsenic resistance typically consists of As(V) reduction (ArsC) to As(III), which is then extruded (ArsB, Acr3, or ArsK), or arsenic methylation (ArsM) followed by extrusion of methylarsenite (ArsP). As(V) reduction can also occur via action of ArrAB to facilitate anaerobic respiration, whereby As(V) is used as an electron acceptor (1). As(III) can be oxidized to As(V) for either detoxification purposes [as As(V) is less toxic than As(III)] or to generate cellular energy using As(III) as an electron donor for both chemolithotrophic and heterotrophic growth (4–6).

Recent studies have begun to focus on the fate of As(V) when it is taken up by bacteria via phosphate (P_i) transporters. P_i and As(V) are close chemical analogs. Once inside the cell, As(V) can substitute for P_i in various biochemical reactions, some of which contribute to the toxic effects of arsenic: i.e., As(V) substitution for P_i interferes with nucleic acid and ATP synthesis. Alternatively, in work that has thus far primarily focused on marine species, As(V) is known to be incorporated into lipids and sugars (7). Studies on cyanobacteria have provided insights into how bacteria incorporate arsenic into carbon scaffolds, an essential step in synthesizing arsenosugars or arsenolipids (8).

Agrobacterium tumefaciens strains GW4 and 5A respond globally to As(III) at the level of gene transcription (9), protein translation, and cellular metabolism (10, 11). We have also shown that under P_i-limiting conditions, these bacteria gain a growth advantage when provided As(V), possibly due to an ability to incorporate As(V) into lipids (12). As(V) is hypothesized to substitute for P_i for some cell functions, allowing the cell to preserve P_i for essential processes such as nucleic acid synthesis and ATP production, where As(V) substitution is not tolerated (12, 13). The combined metabolomics and lipidomics study reported here addresses a knowledge gap and was undertaken to investigate how As(V) influences the intracellular metabolome and lipid composition of A. tumefaciens GW4. Similar to prior studies with As(III) (11), this work reports significant metabolic changes associated with As(V) exposure. Some of the changes in metabolite levels are similar to those reported for A. tumefaciens grown in the presence of As(III), whereas others are unique to A. tumefaciens growth in the presence of As(V). Most noteworthy, lipid profiles were found to be dramatically altered when A. tumefaciens GW4 was grown in the presence of As(V); certain lipids decrease 10- to 50-fold, whereas others increase by up to 15-fold. These observations demonstrate the significant impact of arsenic on cellular growth, deepen our understanding of As(V)’s impact on bacterial metabolism, and fill a knowledge gap about microbe-arsenate (AsV) interactions.

RESULTS

Metabolic response to As(V). Previously, we demonstrated that under phosphate starvation conditions, As(V) can enhance the growth of A. tumefaciens GW4 (12). In this study, global metabolite profiles were analyzed to gain insight into the impact of As(V) on the intracellular metabolome of this bacterium. Approximately 1,500 polar features were detected using a hydrophobic interaction liquid chromatography (HILIC) liquid chromatography-mass spectrometry (LC-MS) method in −As(V) and +As(V) sample groups (see Fig. S1 in the supplemental material). A reverse-phase C_18 liquid chromatography (LC)-MS method revealed approximately 2,600 features in the same samples (Fig. S1). An unsupervised multivariate analysis was performed using principal-
component analysis (PCA) to assess differences in feature abundance (reported as ion intensity) between sample groups. Two-dimensional PCA (2D-PCA) plots of HILIC and reverse-phase LC-MS data sets indicated that As(V) groups separate from each other along the first principal-component (PC1) axis, with PC1 and PC2 accounting for a total of 69% of the variance (PC1 = 44% and PC2 = 25%) and 77% (PC1 = 52% and PC2 = 25%) between groups (Fig. 1). Supervised orthogonal partial least-squares discriminant analysis (OPLS-DA) was performed to assess which metabolite pattern changes contributed most to the separation between control and As(V)-treated groups. The 2D OPLS-DA score plots of HILIC and reverse-phase data sets demonstrated that the samples from As(V)-exposed cell cultures are clearly different from the control (see Fig. S2 in the supplemental material), with values of $R^2_Y = 0.99$ and $Q^2 = 0.71$ in HILIC data sets and $R^2_Y = 0.99$ and $Q^2 = 0.77$ in the reverse-phase data sets, providing high confidence for the OPLS-DA statistical models. Next, an overall comparison between experimental and control groups was undertaken using volcano plots, which revealed that 94 mass spectral features of polar metabolites increased in abundance, while 85 decreased (Fig. 2). A greater number of nonpolar features were found to be altered in reverse-phase LC-MS runs, with 195 nonpolar features increased in abundance and 194 features decreased ($P < 0.05$ and fold change of $>1.5$).

Metabolic pathways altered by As(V). A total of 42 metabolites were identified based on accurate mass and tandem MS (MS/MS) fragmentation analysis, 12 of which were confirmed by LC retention time matches with authentic standards (see Table S1 in the supplemental material). This group consisted primarily of amino and organic acids. Among the identified metabolites, 21 exhibited significantly different levels between control and As(V)-treated groups ($P < 0.05$, fold change of $>1.5$), with 17 increased significantly in As(V)-treated cells (Table S1). To identify which metabolite pathways are impacted by As(V), metabolite-level changes were imported into MetaboAnalyst 4.0 and analyzed using the metabolic pathway impact analysis module of MetaboAnalyst. The pathway impact value threshold was set to 0.1, values above which were considered potentially significant impacted pathways. As scores approach 1.0, the confidence that a specific pathway is perturbed increases (14). This analysis highlighted a number of pathways that are significantly impacted by As(V) treatment, including pathways involved in phenylalanine, glutathione, alanine, aspartate,
glutamate, vitamin B₆, D-glutamine, histidine, tryptophan, arginine, proline, and pyrimidine metabolism (Fig. 3).

Specific metabolites and impacted pathways were mapped onto KEGG pathways annotated for Agrobacterium tumefaciens Ach5 (for which a complete, closed genome sequence is available). The assembled KEGG metabolic network (Fig. 4) revealed that pathway perturbation was primarily reflected in increased metabolite abundance for microbial cells grown in the presence of As(V). Mannitol is the sole carbon source in the MMNH₄ medium and enters glycolysis in the form of fructose-6-P, which is eventually converted to pyruvate prior to being further catabolized via the tricarboxylic acid (TCA) cycle and used for oxidative phosphorylation and aerobic cellular energy (ATP) production. Increased activity of these metabolic pathways is consistent with observed increases in malate and succinate levels in As(V)-treated cells (Fig. 4). In addition to

![FIG 2 Volcano plots highlighting the distinct metabolite profile differences between the +As(V) A. tumefaciens GW4 cells and the −As(V) controls. (A) Volcano plot of MS features identified from the polar HILIC LC-MS analysis, highlighting the 94 and 85 features that are increased and decreased in abundance, respectively, in +As(V) cells. (B) Volcano plot of MS features identified from the nonpolar C₁₈ reverse-phase LC-MS analysis, highlighting the 194 and 195 features that are increased and decreased in abundance, respectively, in the +As(V) cells. Horizontal lines indicate a statistical significance P value of <0.05. Green and red arrows refer to increase and decrease in abundance, respectively, by >1.5-fold change (FC) and a P value of <0.05.](image)

![FIG 3 Metabolic pathway impact analysis resulting from A. tumefaciens GW4 growth in the presence of arsenate [As(V)]. The plot was generated with MetaboAnalyst 4.0 and KEGG metabolic networks corresponding to A. tumefaciens Ach5. Pathways with impact values of ≥0.10 are numbered. Significance ranges from moderate (yellow) to highly significant (red). The size of circles correlates with the number of metabolites that were identified in the LC-MS analysis for each impacted pathway: 1, phenylalanine metabolism; 2, glutathione metabolism; 3, alanine, aspartate, and glutamate metabolism; 4, vitamin B₆ metabolism; 5, α-glutamine and α-glutamate metabolism; 6, histidine metabolism; 7, tryptophan metabolism; 8, arginine and proline metabolism; and 9, pyrimidine metabolism.](image)
increased levels of amino acids, changes in the levels of intermediates involved in the degradation of amino acids were detected. For example, lysine can be degraded via formation of piperolate and saccharopine intermediates, both of which were higher in abundance in the As(V)-treated *A. tumefaciens* GW4 groups, suggesting that As(V) exposure stimulates lysine catabolism. Metabolites reporting on the redox status of cells, including ethanolamine and reduced glutathione, were less abundant following exposure to As(V), suggesting the presence of a more oxidizing intracellular environment in As(V)-treated cells.

To confirm that gene transcripts of TCA cycle enzymes were altered during growth in the presence of As(V), quantitative PCR (qPCR) was employed to track gene expression of relevant genes. Transcript levels of succinyl coenzyme A (succinyl-CoA) synthetase (*sucD*), succinate dehydratase (*sdhA*), fumarate hydratase (*fumC*), and malate dehydrogenase (*mdh*) were significantly higher by a factor of more than 2-fold (see Fig. S3 in the supplemental material) in As(V)-treated cells, suggesting a significant increase in TCA cycle activity. Enhanced TCA cycle activity also inferred that differences in the energy redox state of the cells may also be taking place. To this end, targeted assays were used to measure intracellular ATP and NADH levels. Cellular ATP and NADH concentrations were approximately 10 nM/cell in cells grown without As(V). In the presence of As(V), ATP increased to greater than 15 nM/cell, whereas no significant change in NADH levels was observed (see Fig. S4 in the supplemental material).

**Altered lipid pools in response to As(V).** Our previous work revealed that when *A. tumefaciens* GW4 strains are cultured under P$_i$-limiting conditions, arsenic was detectable in the lipid fraction (12). This led us to conduct a comparative LC-MS analysis of the lipid fractions of *A. tumefaciens* GW4 cells grown with and without As(V). Approximately 1,670 MS lipid features were detected in positive-ion mode and 500 MS features in
negative-ion mode (see Fig. S5 in the supplemental material). PCA analysis revealed that −As(V) cultures grouped together and clearly separated from the +As(V) cells based on distinct MS features observed in positive-ion mode, with the first two principal components (PC1 = 60.2% and PC2 = 16.8%) accounting for 77% of the total variance (Fig. 5A). Separation between control and As(V)-treated groups was less evident based on MS spectral features collected in negative-ion mode (Fig. 5B). OPLS-DA was employed to assess which mass spectral features exhibited significant fold changes that contributed most to the separation between As(V)-treated and control groups. The plot of 2D-OPLS-DA scores indicated that the As(V)-exposed groups are clearly different from the control group, with R2Y = 0.99 and Q2 = 0.92 for the lipid feature changes observed in LC-MS positive-ion mode and R2Y = 0.99 and Q2 = 0.91 for those observed in negative-ion mode (see Fig. S6 in the supplemental material). The high values of R2Y and Q2 indicate that As(V) treatments result in significant changes in lipid composition in A. tumefaciens strain GW4. Analyses using volcano plots quantified differences between the groups, revealing 375 MS features that were increased in abundance and 125 MS features that were decreased in abundance for the data sets collected in positive-ion mode. In negative mode, 29 MS features increased in abundance and 32 decreased based on P values of <0.05 and fold changes of >1.5 (Fig. 6).

**Lipid identification.** The significant difference in the lipid composition inspired a deeper look. Lipids were identified using LipidBlast, a reference library of lipids developed using experimental and *in silico* MS/MS fragmentation data (15). Reverse Dot (Rev-Dot) scores were calculated from the experimental MS/MS data using an automated batch search (16). Rev-Dot scores are a measure of similarity between library and experimental spectra weighted for shared ions. Scores range from 0 to 999, with 999 being a perfect match. A cutoff of 600 was used to reduce false-positive matches (16). From this analysis, 74 lipids were identified with a Rev-Dot score of >600 (see Table S2 in the supplemental material). Identified lipids belonging to glycerophospholipid classes included: phosphatidylcholine (PC), phosphatidylethanolamine (PE), phosphatidylglycerol (PG), phosphatidylserine (PS) and phosphatidic acid (PA) (Table S2). In addition, the three minor lipids lysoPE 18:4, lysoPE 18:1, and lysoPC 20:0 were detected in the MS data collected in positive-ion mode. Representative MS/MS data for fragmentation pattern matching demonstrate the high degree of similarity between
experimental and library spectra, even for minor lipid components such as lysoPC 20:0 and lysoPE 18:1 (Fig. 7). Three glycerolipid classes were assigned, corresponding to monoglycosyldiacylglycerol (MGDG), diglycosyldiacylglycerol (DGDG), and triacylglycerol (TG) (Table S2). DGDG 34:1 and MGDG 40:1 exhibited the highest score possible, 999 (see Fig. S7 in the supplemental material).

The properties of glycerophospholipids depend on the chemical nature of their headgroups, which define their lipid class and yield distinctive fragmentation patterns that can be used for classification (17, 18). To take advantage of these features, we cross-checked recorded MS/MS spectra with diagnostic fragmentation patterns reported for glycerophospholipid headgroups. In positive-ionization mode, phosphatidylcholine (PC)-related ions included m/z 125 [M+H]+, m/z 147 [M+Na]+, and m/z 184...
(protonated phosphatidylcholine). For the phosphatidylethanolamines (PE), the head-group-associated MS fragments included phosphoric acid [M+Na]+ m/z 121 and phosphoethanolamine [M+Na]+ m/z 164. The product ions [M-171]+ and [R+116]+ were diagnostic for phosphatidylglycerol (PG). In the negative-ion mode, R1CH2COO−, R2CH2COO−, [M-H-R2CH=C-O]− and glycerophosphate ions (m/z 153) were used to support these lipid identifications (17). Using this approach, the assignments of 16 glycerophospholipids were validated by matching headgroup fragmentation patterns (see Table S3 in the supplemental material). Overall, a total of 90 lipids could be assigned to specific lipid classes. Of these, 54 lipids were increased in abundance and 36 lipids were decreased in abundance in cells cultured with As(V), with increases up to 14.6-fold and decreases of as much as 50-fold (Table S2 and Table S3). For the identified species, 59 abundance changes were significant, with P values of <0.05 and fold changes of >1.5. Significant differences in glycerolipid and glycerophospholipid species were observed, with elevated levels of MGDG, DGDG, TG, and PG and decreased levels of PE, PA, and the three minor lipids lysoPE 18:4, lysoPE 18:1, and lysoPC 20:0, in the As(V)-treated groups.

**DISCUSSION**

Transcriptomics, proteomics, and metabolomics are being employed to understand microbial global-level responses to arsenic (11, 19–24). However, the majority of these studies have focused on evaluating the effects of arsenite [As(III)]. In contrast, the influence of As(V) on microbial metabolic networks is less understood. This study aids in filling this gap by investigating how bacterial metabolites and lipid compositions change when cells are exposed to As(V). We point out that strain GW4 carries genes for both As(III) oxidation (aioBA) and As(V) reduction (arsC). It is likely that low basal or induced levels of ArsC act to reduce some of the added As(V), so we cannot completely rule out that some of our observations are a result of limited As(III) production. However, the culture conditions used in this study are well documented to favor As(III) oxidation to As(V), such that the net cell activity of GW4 (and our other model bacterium, A. tumefaciens strain 5A) strongly favors As(III) oxidation (6, 25, 26) such that it is not possible to experimentally speciate the arsenic oxyions. Indeed, the only way to detect As(V) reduction is to knock out AioBA activity, which we have done, and that then allows the ArsC activity to be manifested (25). Further, GW4 carries multiple copies of the As(III) extruder Acr3 (10), with the final result being As(III) exported so as to allow for immediate reoxidation to As(V) in the periplasm.

Generation of hydroxyl radical (·OH), hydrogen peroxide (H2O2), and superoxide anion (O2−·) will damage macromolecules such as DNA, proteins, and lipids. This is one of the mechanisms responsible for the cellular toxicity of arsenic (27, 28), while also inducing the restorative measures of DNA repair and oxidative stress response (29–31). Glutathione plays a central role in oxidative stress detoxification and the maintenance of intracellular redox balance (32). Consistent with these observations, our pathway analysis revealed that glutathione metabolism is altered following A. tumefaciens GW4 growth in the presence of As(V) (Fig. 3). Glutamate, 5-oxoproline, and γ-L-glutamyl-L-cysteine are all involved in glutathione metabolism, and their increased levels suggest that glutathione catabolism is upregulated in the As(V)-treated group. The decrease in reduced glutathione suggests that a change in cellular redox potential to a more oxidizing environment has occurred. Under such conditions, DNA repair activities would be expected to increase. The accumulation of nicotinamide supports this inference, as nicotinamide has been reported to reduce arsenic-induced DNA damage and to enhance repair of damaged DNA (33). The increase in tryptophan and altered tryptophan metabolism are also closely related to DNA repair activities. Tryptophan is used in the synthesis of 3-indolepropionic acid, a potent antioxidant used to mitigate DNA damage (34). Increased levels of nicotinamide and tryptophan, along with altered tryptophan-related pathways, allow us to conclude that As(V) exposure requires DNA repair activities in A. tumefaciens. Proline, glutamate, hypotaurine, and betaine can also act as...
reactive oxygen species (ROS) scavengers, intracellular enzyme protectants, inhibitors of lipid peroxidation, and antioxidants (35–38). The increase in proline, glutamate, hypotaurine, and betaine levels in the As(V)-treated group further supports their role as intracellular protectors of oxidative stress.

Metabolic pathway impact analysis also showed that vitamin B$_6$ metabolism and its derivative, pyridoxal 5’-phosphate (PLP), are affected (Fig. 3), resulting in significantly increased PLP levels (Table S2). PLP is an important cofactor for enzymes involved in amino acid metabolism, catalyzing transamination, racemization, decarboxylation, and α/β-elimination reactions (39). While vitamin B$_6$ has a central role in amino acid metabolism, it can also function as a protective agent against ROS (40). The observed increased levels of PLP may thus help ensure amino acid metabolic homeostasis.

Our prior work that examined As(III) metabolic responses employed A. tumefaciens strain 5A (11), whereas in the current As(V) study, we elected to use strain GW4 because it incorporates higher levels of arsenic in cellular materials, particularly lipids, with about 0.4 mmol arsenic/g dry weight of pellet incorporated into the polar lipid fraction of A. tumefaciens GW4 when exposed to 1 mM As(III) or As(V) (12). Also, since all known documentation of arsenic incorporation into carbon skeletons involves the pentavalent species, the ability of GW4 to oxidize As(III) and to respond to low P, made it the best choice for this study. Because this study used a different bacterial strain and arsenic species, readers are cautioned on making direct comparisons between regulated metabolites and pathways. For example, the amino acid profile in As(III)-treated cultures showed an impact on amino acid synthesis radiating from pyruvate (11), presumably due to the previously characterized As(III) inhibition of enzymes containing a dihydrolipoamide dehydrogenase subunit, such as pyruvate dehydrogenase (41–43). In contrast, there was little evidence of this occurring in As(V)-exposed GW4 cultures (Fig. 4). It is interesting that the TCA cycle is perturbed in As(V)-treated cells, at both the transcriptional (Fig. S3) and metabolite (Fig. 4) levels, but again was not apparent in As(III)-exposed cultures (11). Similarly, elevated levels of fumarate, succinate, citrate, and glutarate were also reported in green microalga Scenedesmus sp. strain I1TRIND2 grown in the presence of As(V) (36). When considered in the context of generating cellular energy, it is possible that enhanced TCA cycle activity may have contributed to enhanced ATP levels (Fig. S4), which in turn helps explain As(V)-enhanced growth of P$_i$-stressed GW4 (12).

The impact of As(V) on lipid metabolism was of particular interest in this study. Glycerophospholipids and glycerolipids are major structural components of bacterial membranes, and the ability to adapt the physical properties of membranes to changing environmental conditions is critical to bacterial survival (44–46). Due to the important biological function of lipids and evidence that arsenic can be incorporated in lipids, our study fills a significant gap in knowledge about As(V)’s impact on microbial lipidomes. A prior gas chromatography-MS (GC-MS) assessment of A. tumefaciens GW4 lipids by Wang et al. (6) focused only on the nature of the lipid chains and did not provide any information about headgroups for diacyl lipids. In contrast, the present study on A. tumefaciens strain GW4 utilized LC-MS, enabling the identification of five main glycerophospholipid classes (PC, PE, PG, PA, and PS), along with two minor lysophospholipids (lysoPE and lysoPC), whose levels are altered by As(V) (Table S2 and Table S3). The absence of cardiolipin in our lipid profile maybe due to the lipid extraction method used for this lipidomics analysis. Cardiolipin is generally found associated with membrane proteins and does not strongly partition with other lipids during chloroform-based lipid extraction (47). Decreased levels of PE are consistent with our data that ethanolamine levels are significantly lower in the As(V)-treated A. tumefaciens GW4 groups.

It is interesting to note that PC represents a significant fraction of the lipidome of A. tumefaciens, even though PC is more often associated with eukaryotic membranes. Only 10% of bacterial species produce PC; however, its presence in bacteria has been associated with important functions, including virulence and nitrogen fixation (48–50).
The specific role of PC in *A. tumefaciens* GW4 is unclear. Our LC-MS analysis reveals a mix of increases and decreases in abundance for different PC species, within the context of an overall decrease of phosphate incorporation in membrane components on exposure to As(V). Furthermore, three lipid species (PC 39:6, PC 38:6, and PC 35:1) were not detected in the As(V)-treated groups. These differences could be metabolically driven as part of arsenic resistance. Phosphatidylcholine can be hydrolyzed to release choline, from which betaine is generated, a metabolite that is found in higher levels in As(V)-treated GW4 cells, leading us to hypothesize that this mechanism is used to spare phosphate for other biological functions.

Our identification of lysophospholipids in *A. tumefaciens* strain GW4 was unexpected. There are reports of lysoPEs and lysoPGs being present in bacterial membranes (50). In mammals, lysoPC is formed as a result of the action of lecithin-cholesterol acyltransferase (LCAT) in plasma (51). Our finding of lysoPC 20:0 in GW4 (Fig. 7) is, to our knowledge, the first evidence of this lipid class in *A. tumefaciens*. The significant decrease of this lipid upon As(V) exposure suggests that lysoPC regulation is altered by As(V). LysoPCs are decreased in rats following arsenic exposure (52).

Under phosphate-limited conditions, bacteria have been shown to replace up to 40% of cellular Pᵢ-containing compounds by (i) recycling phospholipids (53), (ii) down-regulating genes encoding synthesis of Pᵢ-rich techoic acids (54, 55), (iii) synthesizing and utilizing sulfolipids instead of phospholipids (56, 57), and (iv) replacing glycerophospholipids with glycerolipids (44). Evidence of Pᵢ-sparing mechanisms being present in *A. tumefaciens* GW4 when grown in the presence of As(V) is revealed by the observed increase of deoxyadenosine and dAMP in this treatment group. Hydrolysis of dAMP releases orthophosphate, which can be used in molecules for which phosphate is critical (Table S1). It is quite possible that synthesis of arsenolipids is another mechanism of Pᵢ sparing. Our previous work suggested that under low-phosphate conditions, arsenic accumulates in the lipid fraction along with a significant Pᵢ decrease (12). Given that half of the glycerophospholipids in *A. tumefaciens* GW4 are decreased in abundance in the As(V)-treated group, our data strongly support a remodeling of lipid composition when *A. tumefaciens* GW4 is grown in the presence of As(V) (Table S2 and Table S3).

Beyond phosphate limitation, altering cellular lipid composition is an adaptation to different environmental conditions, including temperature, ionic strength, and antibiotics (47, 58–60). As described here, LC-MS omics-level analyses of bacterial metabolism can deepen our understanding of adaptive mechanisms and response to stress. Taken together, the metabolomics and lipidomics profiles obtained herein from LC-MS experiments enable us to better understand the cellular adaptations of *A. tumefaciens* strain GW4 to As(V) exposure and strengthen the relationship between changes in the biomolecular distribution of phosphate and cellular responses to arsenic.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

**Materials and chemicals.** HNa₂AsO₄·7H₂O [sodium arsenate, referred to here as As(V)], ammonium acetate, sodium chloride, formic acid, and all culture medium components were purchased from Sigma (St. Louis, MO). High-performance liquid chromatography (HPLC)-grade water, methanol, chloroform, acetonitrile, and acetone were purchased from Thermo-Fisher Scientific (Pittsburgh, PA). Pasteur pipettes, glass pipettes, and LC-MS autosampler vials were purchased from VWR (Radnor, PA). Screw-thread vials and 15-ml glass conical tubes were purchased from Thermo-Fisher Scientific (Pittsburgh, PA) and Corning (Pittston, PA), respectively.

**Cell culture.** *A. tumefaciens* GW4 was cultured at 30°C in 50 ml of defined minimal mannitol medium (MMNH₄) (61), modified to contain 100 μM Pᵢ and 1 mM As(III), overnight. Cells were harvested by centrifugation for 20 min at 4,000 × g, washed 3 times with 20 ml of Tris buffer (pH 7.0), and resuspended in fresh MMNH₄ containing 100 μM Pᵢ. Three of the six cultures were supplemented with 1 mM As(V). Culture conditions replicate those of Wang et al. and were designed to mimic low-Pᵢ and increasing-As(V) conditions experienced by As(III)-oxidizing organisms in the environment (6). Cultures were monitored using optical density at 600 nm (OD₆₀₀) readings and harvested in late log phase (16h). Cells were centrifuged at 12,000 rpm for 30 min and washed 3 times with 20 ml of ice-cold 0.85% NaCl, and resulting cell pellets were stored at ~80°C until further use. Final biomass was assessed by measuring dry weight.
Metabolite extraction. Cell pellets were resuspended in 3 volumes of distilled water and sonicated for 5 min at a 60% duty cycle. An equal volume of methanol was added before vortexing for 30 s, followed by removal of cellular debris using centrifugation at 20,000 × g for 15 min at −4°C. To the supernatant solution, 5 volumes of cold acetone was added, and the resulting samples were frozen at −80°C overnight to precipitate proteins, which were subsequently removed by centrifugation at 20,000 × g for 5 min. For each sample, the resulting supernatant was transferred to a fresh Eppendorf tube and dried using a speed vacuum for 3 h (no heat), and the resulting final metabolite extracts were stored at −80°C until further analysis.

Lipid extraction. Lipids were extracted for LC-MS analysis following published protocols with slight modifications (62). For each sample, 0.01 to 0.012 g of cell pellet was resuspended in 0.45 mL of ice-cold 100 mM Tris buffer (pH 7.5) and transferred to a glass vial, followed by addition of 1.2 mL of 1:1 chloroform-methanol. After gentle mixing, the resulting mixture was centrifuged at 3,000 × g for 5 min. The lower (darker) chloroform layer containing the lipid fraction was carefully transferred into a clean glass vial using a glass Pasteur pipette. The procedure was repeated a second time, and the resulting lipid fractions were combined and dried under a stream of N2. Samples were stored at −80°C until further analysis.

LC-MS analysis. LC-MS analysis was performed using an Agilent 1290 UPLC system connected to an Agilent 6538 quadrupole time of flight (Q-TOF) mass spectrometer (Agilent Technologies, Santa Clara, CA). A Cogent Diamond Hydride HILIC column (150 mm by 2.1 mm, 4 µm, 100 Å; Microwave Technology Corporation, Eatontown, NJ), and a Zorbax RRHD Eclipse Plus (150 mm by 2.1 mm, 1.8 µm) reverse-phase C18 column (Agilent Technologies, Santa Clara, CA) were used to separate polar and nonpolar metabolites, respectively, prior to mass spectrometry (MS) analysis. Metabolite extracts were resuspended in 60 µL of 50% MeOH, from which 10 µL was injected into the C18 column for the nonpolar analysis. For analysis of polar compounds, metabolite extracts were diluted 10-fold before LC-MS on the HILIC column. The two mobile phases utilized for metabolite elution from the HILIC column consisted of A, H2O, and B, acetonitrile, both containing 0.1% formic acid, with a flow rate of 0.6 mL min⁻¹. Gradient conditions for nonpolar metabolite elution from the C18 reverse-phase column were as follows. A gradient of A/B solvents starting at a 98:2 ratio was changed to 2:98 over 24 min, held at 2:98 for 2 min, and then returned to the starting condition for column equilibration (26.1 to 30 min). The gradient of A/B solvents (as described above) for elution of polar metabolites started at a ratio of 5:95, was ramped to 70:30 over 13 min, and returned to the 5:95 A/B solvent ratio for the remaining 15 min of the 15-min chromatography program. MS analysis was conducted in positive-ion mode with a capillary voltage of 3,500 V, a mass fragment voltage of 120 V, and a skimmer voltage of 45 V. The drying gas temperature was set at 350°C, with a flow of 12 liters/min and the nebulizer set to 35 lb/in². For the MS/MS experiment, a target list including previously determined exact masses and associated retention times was generated and used to guide the MS/MS fragmentation. The collision energy was fixed at 20 V across a 1.0-min retention time window.

For lipid analysis, the extracts were resuspended in 500 µL of methanol, transferred to 1.5-mL Eppendorf tubes, and speed vacuumed for 2 h. The resulting dried samples were resuspended in 150 µL of methanol and centrifuged at 10,000 rpm for 3 min to remove precipitates. Finally, 130 µL of each sample supernatant was transferred to LC-MS autosampler vials, and 2 µL was injected onto a C8 Acquity UPLC bridged ethylene hybrid column (100- by 2.1-mm, inner diameter of 1.7 µm), at a flow rate of 0.6 mL min⁻¹. The mobile phase consisted of A, H2O, and B, acetonitrile, both containing 0.1% formic acid. The gradient of A/B solvents started at 25% A and changed to 1% A over 15 min, remained at 1% for 13 min, then returned to initial conditions for the last 2 min of the LC run. MS analysis was conducted in positive- and negative-ion modes. Data-dependent MS/MS (the 3 most abundant ions), the scan range was set at 50 to 1,700 m/z with an acquisition rate of 1 spectrum per second, with a collision energy of 10 V. Targeted MS/MS analyses were performed using collision energies of 10, 20, 30, and 40 V. Raw LC-MS data in the form of mass/charge ratio, retention time, and intensity are included in Data Set S1 in the supplemental material.

LC-MS data processing and statistical analysis. Data acquisition and spectral analysis were performed using the MassHunter software (Qualitative Analysis version 8.04.00; Agilent Technologies). Raw data files were converted to MZxml format and processed by MZmine for peak detection to build chromatograms, retention time normalization, gap filling, and alignment. An intensity threshold of 1,000 was applied to discriminate signals (MS peaks) from noise. Retention time, mass/charge ratio (m/z), and spectral intensities normalized to cell pellet weight were tabulated. Statistical analyses, including principal-component analysis (PCA) and volcano plots, were generated using the Perseus software (63). Orthogonal partial least-squares discriminant analysis (OPLS-DA) was performed using MetaboAnalyst 4.0, and permutation tests of the OPLS-DA model were conducted to assess R²Y and Q2 values and robustness of the OPLS-DA modeling (64). To assign spectral features to specific metabolite identities (IDs), m/z values and retention time values were loaded into the Mummichog server with a mass tolerance of 20 ppm (65), and the presence of potential metabolites was further established using the BIOCYC reference database of genes and metabolic pathways for Agrobacterium tumefaciens CCNWGS0286, used as the reference organism. All m/z values detected from HILIC column eluants were cross-checked against our in-house metabolite standard library, with both observed m/z value and retention time required to match to metabolite standard values (m/z tolerance of 20 ppm and retention time tolerance of 0.5 min). Targeted MS/MS data were generated to further confirm metabolite IDs. MS/MS data were converted to “mgf” files using the ProteoWizard software, and MS/MS-based metabolite identification was performed using the SIRIUS and METLIN databases (66, 67). Pathway analysis was carried out using KEGG and MetaboAnalyst 4.0 (64, 68). Identification of lipid features was achieved using the LipidBlast and METLIN databases (15, 67).
Quantitative RT-PCR analysis. Total cellular RNA extraction from harvested cells used the TRIzol reagent kit (Invitrogen, Grand Island, NY) following the manufacturer’s instructions. Real-time reverse transcription-PCR (RT-PCR) was performed using an ABI VIIA7 in 0.1-ml Fast Optical 96-well reaction plates (ABI). Primers are listed in Table 1. Gene expression was normalized by threshold cycle (ΔΔCT) and analyzed by comparing the retention times of the samples to that of authentic standards.

Analysis of ATP and NADH. Cells were collected by centrifugation (20,000 × g, 5 min, 4°C) and resuspended in 1 ml of 0.4 M perchloric acid with 1.0 mM EDTA. After 5 min of ultrasonication on ice, cellular debris were removed by centrifugation (20,000 × g, 5 min, 4°C). The pH of the extracts was adjusted to 7.0 using a 1 M K2CO3 stock solution and percolated through a 0.22-μm-pore filter membrane, and the resulting samples were analyzed by HPLC (HPLC 2690 series, Waters, MA). The mobile phase used to measure ATP and NADH contained 90% 50 mM phosphate buffer, 10% acetonitrile, and 3.22 g/liter tetrabutylammonium bromide (pH 6.8), at a flow of 1 ml/min. ATP and NADH were identified by comparing the retention times of the samples to those of authentic standards.

SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL

Supplemental material is available online only.

SUPPLEMENTAL FILE 1, PDF file, 0.9 MB.
SUPPLEMENTAL FILE 2, XLSX file, 0.9 MB.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research was supported in part by funding from the U.S. National Science Foundation to T.R.M. and B.B. (MCB 0817170 and MCB 1413321) and V.C. (MCB 1714556). W.Z. and G.W. receive support from the National Science Foundation of China (31670108) and the National Institute of General Medical Sciences (DBI-1532078), and the National Institute of General Medical Sciences (DBI-1532078), and the National Institute of General Medical Sciences of the National Institutes of Health under award no. P20GM103474.

We thank Jesse Thomas for technical assistance with mass spectrometry. We declare that we have no conflicts of interest.

REFERENCES


---

**TABLE 1** Primers used in this research

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primer pair</th>
<th>Primer sequence</th>
<th>Use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>qRT-16S-F</td>
<td>5’ GGATACCATGAGAGACGA 3’</td>
<td>qRT-PCR for 16S rRNA gene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qRT-16S-R</td>
<td>5’ GCAACTAGGCGAGGG 3’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qRT-mdh-F</td>
<td>5’ GTTCCGCCGCTCCTCCT 3’</td>
<td>qRT-PCR for mdh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qRT-mdh-R</td>
<td>5’ GTCGACCCATCTCTCTCTC 3’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qRT-SucDb-F</td>
<td>5’ AAAGCCGCGTGTCCCTT 3’</td>
<td>qRT-PCR for sucDb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qRT-SucDb-R</td>
<td>5’ TTCTCGCGGCGGTCTGGT 3’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qRT-SucDa-F</td>
<td>5’ CCGACCGCTCACTTACTT 3’</td>
<td>qRT-PCR for sucDa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qRT-SucDa-R</td>
<td>5’ CGCCGATCCCTTCCTCTCA 3’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qRT-fumC-F</td>
<td>5’ CATTCCCCGCGTCTCCTGCT 3’</td>
<td>qRT-PCR for fumC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qRT-fumC-R</td>
<td>5’ GCATTCGTGTCGCTCTTCTC 3’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qRT-sdhA-F</td>
<td>5’ ACCATGTCGCTGGTGGC 3’</td>
<td>qRT-PCR for sdhA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qRT-sdhA-R</td>
<td>5’ CGGTCCCCGTTGAACTGAA 3’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Zhuang et al. Applied and Environmental Microbiology


March 2021 Volume 87 Issue 6 e02261-20 aem.asm.org 14