



Ecology of Yellowstone cutthroat trout and an evaluation of potential effects of angler wading in the Yellowstone River
by Barbara Marie Kelly

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science in Fish and Wildlife Management
Montana State University
© Copyright by Barbara Marie Kelly (1993)

Abstract:

There has been concern that heavy angling pressure in the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and the Upper Falls may result in high wading-caused mortality of Yellowstone cutthroat trout embryo and pre-emergent fry. Effects of angler wading were evaluated for 1991. Factors considered included: number and distribution of redds; timing of spawning, embryonic development, and emergence; and amount and distribution of angler wading. In 1991, mortality from angler was estimated at 9.3% of the eggs laid. Estimated mortality was low because of the closure of 12 of 26 km of the river, which protected 60% of the redds, and the July 15 opening date which protected eggs for part of their development. Annual differences in the timing of embryonic development and emergence will change the amount of potential wading caused mortality. Cutthroat trout fry emergence was about 2 weeks earlier in 1990 than in 1991. Population level effects of reduced survival to emergence were evaluated by considering population limitations and regulations at several life stages. Based on visual estimation of surface substrate composition and amount of spawning in the river, spawning did not appear to be limiting. Recruitment of cutthroat trout from tributaries was insignificant. Trout fry were generally abundant along shorelines during peak emergence, but numbers declined by over 90% within 25 d in counting transects in 1990 and 1991, due to mortality and emigration. The adult cutthroat trout population appeared to be large. Population regulation probably occurs at stages other than the incubation period in the Yellowstone cutthroat trout population of the study area.

ECOLOGY OF YELLOWSTONE CUTTHROAT TROUT AND AN
EVALUATION OF POTENTIAL EFFECTS OF ANGLER
WADING IN THE YELLOWSTONE RIVER

by

Barbara Marie Kelly

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree

of

Master of Science

in

Fish and Wildlife Management

MONTANA STATE UNIVERSITY
Bozeman, Montana

April 1993

7378
K2949

APPROVAL

of a thesis submitted by

Barbara Marie Kelly

This thesis has been read by each member of the graduate committee and has been found to be satisfactory regarding content, English usage, format, citations, bibliographic style, and consistency, and is ready for submission to the College of Graduate Studies.

23 April 1993
Date

Robert S. White
Chairperson, Graduate Committee

Approved for the Major Department

22 April 1993
Date

Robert S. Moore
Head, Major Department

Approved for the College of Graduate Studies

5/3/93
Date

Rd Brown
Graduate Dean

STATEMENT OF PERMISSION TO USE

In presenting this thesis in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a master's degree at Montana State University, I agree that the Library shall make it available to borrowers under rules of the Library.

If I have indicated my intention to copyright this thesis by including a copyright notice page, copying is allowable only for scholarly purposes, consistent with "fair use" as prescribed in the U.S. Copyright Law. Requests for permission for extended quotation from or reproduction of this thesis in whole or in parts may be granted only by the copyright holder.

Signature

Barbara M. Kelly

Date

April 22, 1993

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I sincerely thank the people who have assisted in all phases of this study. Dr. Robert White directed the study and critically reviewed the manuscript. Drs. Calvin Kaya and Robert Moore, Dan Carty, Ron Jones, and Lynn Kaeding also reviewed the manuscript.

The U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service in Yellowstone National Park initiated the study and provided technical assistance and advice throughout the study. I thank the many Fish and Wildlife Service employees and volunteers for their field assistance and input to the project. I thank the Yellowstone National Park Service for their assistance and support. Maps presented in this thesis were produced at the Geographic Information Systems Laboratory at Mammoth; sincere thanks to George McKay and John Hamilton for their invaluable help with GIS. I thank the faculty and staff at Montana State University for providing so many learning opportunities during my time here. My special thanks to my friends over the years for enriching my life. I extend my love and gratitude to Audrey, Steve, and Doug Kelly, and Lori and Jim Knudsen for the support they gave throughout the study. This thesis is dedicated to my late father, Robert Kelly, who continues to inspire me.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF TABLES	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	xii
ABSTRACT	xiv
INTRODUCTION	1
STUDY AREA	5
Tributaries	12
Thistle Creek	12
Elk Antler Creek	13
Trout Creek	13
Cottongrass Creek	13
Sour Creek	14
Alum Creek	14
Otter Creek	14
METHODS	15
Discharge and Water Quality	15
Substrate Composition	16
Spawning Areas and Redds	16
Timing of Spawning	17
Embryonic Development	18
Cutthroat Trout Fry	18
Adult Trout and Movements	19
Angler Use	20
Tributaries	20
Geographic Information Systems (GIS) Analysis	21
Estimate of Angler Wading Mortality of Cutthroat Trout Embryos and Pre-Emergent Fry	22
Worst-Case-Scenario Wading-Caused Mortality Rates	24

TABLE OF CONTENTS--Continued

	Page
RESULTS	25
Discharge and Water Quality	25
Substrate Composition	30
Redd Distribution	30
Spawning	34
Embryonic Development	37
Cutthroat Trout Fry	37
Time of Emergence	37
Distribution	44
Lengths of Fry	44
Spawning Trout and Redds	48
Characteristics of the Spawning Trout	
Population	48
Adult Trout Movement	48
Angler Use	54
Estimated Mortality of Cutthroat Trout	
Embryos and Pre-Emergent Fry Resulting from	
Angler Wading, 1991	56
Worst-Case-Scenario Wading-Caused	
Mortality Rates	58
Tributaries	59
Thistle Creek	59
Elk Antler Creek	59
Trout Creek	62
Alum Creek	63
Sour Creek	63
Otter Creek	65
DISCUSSION	66
REFERENCES CITED	78
APPENDICES	85
Appendix A--Model for Estimating Wading-Caused	
Mortality	86
Appendix B--Data Used for Calculations of	
Wading-Caused Mortality	91
Appendix C--Tag Return Data	97

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1. Description of the locations of the three study segments and groups of sections, Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls	10
2. Substrate size classification modified from the Wentworth classification (Welch 1948) . .	16
3. Chemical characteristics of the middle and lower study segments of the Yellowstone River, 1991	26
4. Field measurements of dissolved oxygen, alkalinity, pH, and conductivity in the upper, middle and lower segments of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 1991	27
5. Monthly minimum, maximum, and mean water temperature ($^{\circ}$ C), and monthly mean daily temperature fluctuation of the upper, middle, and lower segments of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 22 May - 14 September 1990 and 1991	28
6. Estimated area in the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 1991, comprised of fines, gravel, cobble, and boulder estimated to the nearest 25%, listed in ascending order of mean substrate diameter	31
7. Estimated number of redds in groups of sections on right and left river-sides, Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Chittenden Bridge, 1991	34

LIST OF TABLES--Continued

Table	Page
8. Stage of sexual maturity and male:female ratio of adult cutthroat trout electrofished in the upper, middle, and lower segments of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 1990	35
9. Embryonic development of cutthroat trout eggs in Porter boxes placed in the Buffalo Ford side-channel, 1991	38
10. Number of days and celsius temperature units between beginning and peak of spawning and fry emergence for cutthroat trout in the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 1990 and 1991	38
11. Mean lengths and length ranges of cutthroat trout fry and percentages of trout ≤ 25 mm total length captured by hand-netting in the middle segment of the Yellowstone River between LeHardy Rapids and Sulphur Caldron (middle segment), 1990	40
12. Weekly mean lengths and length ranges of cutthroat trout fry, and percentages of trout ≤ 25 mm captured by hand-netting in the upper, middle, and lower segments of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 1991	43
13. Right bank counts of cutthroat trout fry along 11 25-m longitudinal transects, Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and LeHardy Rapids (upper segment), 1991	44

LIST OF TABLES--Continued

Table	Page
14. Mean, standard deviation, and range of total lengths, weights, and condition factors of spawning males, females, and juvenile Yellowstone cutthroat trout (non-spawning trout <350 mm) captured by electrofishing in the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls in May and June, 1990	50
15. Number and percentage of juvenile trout (non-spawning trout <350 mm) and number of adult trout captured by electrofishing in the upper, middle, and lower segments of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls in May and June, 1990	50
16. Number of tagged trout recaptured by various methods, Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 1990 - 1992	53
17. Movement of adult cutthroat trout tagged in 1990 in the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls based on recaptures in 1990, 1991 and 1992	53
18. The mean number of anglers counted and the percentage of the sum of anglers in groups of sections along the left bank and right bank, summarized bimonthly for 15 July - 31 August 1991, Yellowstone River from 0.6 km below Fishing Bridge to Chittenden Bridge	55
19. Percent of all redds, angler hours, anglers wading, angler wading-caused mortality for July, August, and season for the areas open to angling in the upper, middle, and lower segments of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 1991	58

LIST OF TABLES--Continued

Table	Page
20. Chemical characteristics of Thistle, Elk Antler, and Trout creeks, 1991	60
21. Water temperatures (°C) measured in Thistle, Elk Antler, and Trout creeks, 1991	61
22. Field measurements of dissolved oxygen, alkalinity, pH, and conductivity in Thistle, Elk Antler, Trout, Alum, Sour, and Otter creeks, 1991	61
23. Chemical characteristics of Sour, Alum, and Otter creeks, 1991	64
24. Water temperatures (°C) measured in Sour, Alum, and Otter creeks, 1991	65
25. Days and celsius temperature units for Yellowstone cutthroat trout embryonic development	68
26. Mean percent of pre-eyed eggs, eyed eggs, pre-emergent fry, and emerged fry by month, and the mortality rate used for the month for redds waded on once only or twice daily for the upper, middle, and lower segments of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 1991	89
27. Data used for calculations of wading-caused mortality	92
28. Individual tag returns of cutthroat trout tagged in 1990 in the upper, middle, and lower segments of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls and recaptured in 1990 and 1991	98

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
1. Yellowstone River, Yellowstone National Park, Wyoming, from Yellowstone Lake to the Upper Falls.	6
2. Sections 1-52 in the upper, middle, and lower segments of the Yellowstone River from Yellowstone Lake to mid Hayden Valley	8
3. Sections 47-84 in the lower segment of the Yellowstone River from mid Hayden Valley to Upper Falls	9
4. Mean weekly water temperatures ($^{\circ}$ C) measured in the Buffalo Ford area (section 39) of the Yellowstone River, 20 May - 8 September 1990 and 12 May - 8 September 1991	27
5. Mean daily discharge, in cubic meters per second, measured at a U.S.G.S. (1991) staff gauge located in the Yellowstone River 0.5 km below Yellowstone Lake, April - September, 1990 and 1991	29
6. Spawning areas and redds in the Yellowstone River from Yellowstone Lake to mid Hayden Valley, 1991	32
7. Spawning areas and redds in the Yellowstone River from mid Hayden Valley to Upper Falls, 1991	33
8. The number of trout counted by week during the spawning season in all sections of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 1991	36
9. The mean number of cutthroat trout fry per 25 m in the Buffalo Ford area of the Yellowstone River, 1990	39

LIST OF FIGURES--Continued

Figure		Page
10.	The mean number of cutthroat trout fry per 25 m in the nine 25 m counting transects in the upper, middle, and lower segments of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 1991	42
11.	Maximum cutthroat trout fry densities in fry per 25 m and redd densities in redds per ha for the 84 sections along the right bank of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 1991	45
12.	Length frequency distributions by week of cutthroat trout fry collected in the Buffalo Ford area of the Yellowstone River, 1990	46
13.	Length frequency distributions by week of cutthroat trout fry collected in the upper, middle, and lower segments of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 1991	47
14.	Length frequency distributions of all cutthroat trout fry collected in the Yellowstone River in 1990 and 1991	49
15.	Length frequency distribution of 1282 Yellowstone cutthroat trout 350-515 mm electrofished in the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, May and June 1990	51
16.	Estimated percentages of developing cutthroat trout at the pre-eyed egg, eyed egg, pre-emergent fry, and emerged fry stage in the upper, middle, and lower segments of the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls, 15 July - 8 September 1991.	57

ABSTRACT

There has been concern that heavy angling pressure in the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and the Upper Falls may result in high wading-caused mortality of Yellowstone cutthroat trout embryo and pre-emergent fry. Effects of angler wading were evaluated for 1991. Factors considered included: number and distribution of redds; timing of spawning, embryonic development, and emergence; and amount and distribution of angler wading. In 1991, mortality from angler was estimated at 9.3% of the eggs laid. Estimated mortality was low because of the closure of 12 of 26 km of the river, which protected 60% of the redds, and the July 15 opening date which protected eggs for part of their development. Annual differences in the timing of embryonic development and emergence will change the amount of potential wading caused mortality. Cutthroat trout fry emergence was about 2 weeks earlier in 1990 than in 1991. Population level effects of reduced survival to emergence were evaluated by considering population limitations and regulations at several life stages. Based on visual estimation of surface substrate composition and amount of spawning in the river, spawning did not appear to be limiting. Recruitment of cutthroat trout from tributaries was insignificant. Trout fry were generally abundant along shorelines during peak emergence, but numbers declined by over 90% within 25 d in counting transects in 1990 and 1991, due to mortality and emigration. The adult cutthroat trout population appeared to be large. Population regulation probably occurs at stages other than the incubation period in the Yellowstone cutthroat trout population of the study area.

INTRODUCTION

Yellowstone cutthroat trout Oncorhynchus clarki bouvieri entered Yellowstone Lake and the Yellowstone River after the last ice age, 8,000 years ago, and now this population is the largest concentration of native interior cutthroat trout (Behnke 1992). The Upper Falls and Lower Falls of the Yellowstone River, downstream from Yellowstone Lake, have prevented upstream movement of non-native fishes into the system, and Federal legislation and National Park Service policies have also protected this population. The current goal of the Yellowstone National Park aquatic management program is to "... allow ecological processes to function as if uninfluenced by modern man, while providing for visitor use and education" (Jones et al. 1992)

The Yellowstone cutthroat trout population in the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and the Upper Falls may be the most intensively fished native trout stock in North America (Jones et al. 1990). Annual angler effort in the 14 km of stream open to angling has averaged 127,000 h/yr for the past 5 years, which is equivalent to 1,257 angler hours per hectare (Jones et al. 1992). Yellowstone cutthroat trout are vulnerable to angling, but hooking

mortality in the Yellowstone River is low (Schill et al. 1986).

Cutthroat trout from both the river and the lake spawn in the Yellowstone River; allacustrine spawners comprise a discrete stock within the lake (Bowler 1975; Liebelt 1968; Raleigh and Chapman 1971; Varley and Gresswell 1988). The importance of the Yellowstone River tributaries for cutthroat trout reproduction and recruitment into the river is unknown.

Because of the heavy angling pressure within spawning areas, there has been concern that anglers wading on cutthroat trout redds in the Yellowstone River may reduce survival. Roberts (1988) and Roberts and White (1992) evaluated wading-caused mortality of embryo and pre-emergent trout fry in the laboratory. Embryo mortality rates varied with stage of development at the time of wading and with the frequency of wading. Eggs were most sensitive just prior to hatching, when a single wading event killed up to 46% of the embryos. Maximum mortality of up to 96% resulted from twice-daily wading throughout development.

The different mortality rates due to angler wading relate to trout embryonic development. When an egg enters the hypotonic medium, fluids fill the perivitelline space, hardening the chorion (Knight 1963; Blaxter 1969). Lipid droplets buoy the embryo in a dorsal position within the

chorion (Knight 1963). During this pre-eyed period the egg is very resistant to crushing (Hayes 1949), and wading mortality is low (Roberts 1988; Roberts and White 1992). The embryo is sensitive to physical disturbance during blastopore closure, which occurs about mid-way between fertilization and eye-up (Johnson et al. 1983; Dwyer et al. in press). Wading-caused mortality of pre-eyed eggs during blastopore closure ranged from 4-10%, compared to 76-94% mortality from handling, perhaps due to relatively little physical disturbance within the substrate (Roberts 1988; Roberts and White 1992). Half-way between eye-up and hatch, enzymes are excreted into the perivitelline space to soften the chorion for hatching (Blaxter 1969; Knight 1963). Wading mortality is highest between the start of chorion softening and hatch (Roberts 1988; Roberts and White 1992); less than 1 kg pressure is required to burst eggs at this stage (Hayes 1949). After hatch, the pre-emergent fry's fragile body parts are vulnerable to crushing and wading mortality is high, although less than during the period of chorion softening (Roberts 1988; Roberts and White 1992). Indirect mortality from wading can result from the spread of Saprolegnia spp. from dead eggs (Smith et al. 1985).

The goal of this study was to evaluate the potential effects of angler wading on the Yellowstone cutthroat trout population between Yellowstone Lake and Upper Falls and to

gather information about this Yellowstone cutthroat trout population and its habitat.

Specific objectives of the study were to:

X 1. Describe the physical and chemical characteristics of the Yellowstone River and tributaries.

2. Evaluate the distribution and availability of spawning habitat in the Yellowstone River and tributaries, and to evaluate the potential for recruitment of cutthroat trout from the tributaries to the Yellowstone River.

X 3. Quantify the number and distribution of redds.

X 4. Document the timing of cutthroat trout spawning, embryonic developmental stages, hatching, and emergence, and to relate this to the timing of wading.

X 5. Monitor the abundance, growth, and distribution of cutthroat trout fry.

6. Characterize the adult cutthroat trout population and examine their movements.

7. Document the amount and distribution of wading by anglers.

8. Estimate wading-caused mortality of trout eggs and pre-emergent fry.

STUDY AREA

The study area is in the central part of Yellowstone National Park, located in northwest Wyoming. The study was conducted on the Yellowstone River between Yellowstone Lake and the Upper Falls, 26 km downstream, and on the tributaries to the river within this reach: Thistle, Elk Antler, Trout, Cottongrass, Sour, Alum, and Otter creeks (Figure 1).

The Yellowstone River drains Yellowstone Lake at its northern end. Several characteristics of the river are influenced by the lake. Yellowstone Lake is a large, oligotrophic lake with a watershed of 261,590 ha, a surface area of 354 km² and a mean depth of 42 m (Benson 1961). Ice covers the lake from mid-December through May or June and the lake temperatures rarely exceed 18°C (Jones et al. 1992), and water temperatures in the river are moderated by those in the lake. Inflow to the river is relatively constant, and mean annual flow, measured 0.6 km downstream of the lake outlet, during the period of record, 1927-1991, was 37.64 m³/s (U.S. Geological Survey 1991).

From Yellowstone Lake to Upper Falls the Yellowstone River drops from an elevation of 2357 m to 2326 m, an average gradient of 1.2 m/km. The river pattern is

